

Mark Evilsizer 2:00

Okay, we next have a discussion and decision regarding a livestreaming of governing board meetings. Is there a motion to approve? (Deerfield seconds)

Discussion?

Nancy Ann Hensch 2:21

I'd like to know what the difference would be between live streaming, or recording the meetings and then having them closed captioned after the fact. So they'd be closed caption appropriately.

Joi Lin Blake 2:33

Well, we've done a preliminary, um we haven't been able to complete the feasibility study, because he had some other priorities in

Jim Odom 2:40

in

Joi Lin Blake 2:40

terms of things we need to do... um..but what we...it's the cost difference.

Nancy Ann Hensch 2:44

(But what is the cost difference?)

Joi Lin Blake 2:46

Um but I asked Jim Odom, I (always call him Tom so if I can look hard... (laughter).

Right. **So anyway, I'm asked Jim, to pull together some preliminary information for us to let us know kind of what the cost implications would be for the District.**

And then we can go for the Board Meeting decision (*inaudible..today?*) (*then?*)

Mark Evilsizer 3:13

Yeah, please do.

Jim Odom 3:16

Can I keep my jacket on? I can barely, barely.....(*inaudible*) lucky you you have any... (*inaudible*)

Yeah, so actually, I, I've been kind of thinking about this for a few years, I think that somebody came up. Not long after I got here seven years ago, I remember it was a topic of conversation. I've been involved in streaming board meetings of various types and different locations. So, I've had some experience with it. But specific to the conversation for this room. **So, Dr. Blake, I think a few weeks ago, and or maybe a couple of months ago, it was brought up to the board here officially as an agenda item. And so, I've been pondering that, and Dr. Blake and I spoke a few weeks ago, and she asked me to give it a little more thought.** So I wanted to approach it, just to give you some information I basically on two fronts, one would be given, given the way the board meetings are conducted at this moment in time and and

this room, **could we do it easily, in a way that would give a quality presentation for streaming or broadcasting. And my opinion on that is, is no.** And the reason is because this room is not conducive to doing a good broadcast or streaming of the board meetings. We have recorded in this room before. But it's always been one camera, one speaker type of events. And that works pretty well that to do a board meeting where I think tonight's a good example, where we've had, I think I counted about 10 different speakers already from different locations, whether it's on the dais or here at the podium, uhhh that creates a lot of challenges. And essentially, you would have to have about four cameras in this room to do that well. And because of the nature of cameras, tripods ascent, much you can imagine, you end up with more equipment in the room and more people than you do, actually in the board meeting. And so I've been in situations like that, and it is not conducive to a good meeting, it really beats the meeting, when that happens, and it's just very difficult. **Couldn't be done really very well with one camera.** The problem is, there's no way to go that quickly to catch you speaking. And, and another problem with this room, I'll talk about this in a second, **the lighting up on the board is terrible, quite frankly, it's very dark up there.** That's an issue we've always had as well with recording in this room. **So there are some real challenges physically, and so it just isn't a good situation to just come in and just to try to do it. Could you do it? Yes. Would it be a presentation anybody would want to watch? Probably no, it really it really wouldn't address the issues that have been brought up.** So given that fact, the second point would be how would you do it. And so I should give you a little bit of my background. In working with this. When I was faculty member at (inaudible) university, I was actually hired as a consultant with a with a group of people to work on a similar issue for the Indianapolis Metropolitan School Board. They wanted to stream. We did that project for them. At the time, it was a very big project. And essentially, it was a very, very similar project, it was a room that was that was not built for that purpose. And that, that's something to keep in mind is if you look at similar places around the county, and I've done a little research, but I'll point to Oceanside city council meetings: A purpose built room, and that's what you'll find in most cases is they built the room with that in mind. So it's built with cameras, everything already installed. And that that's what that's the biggest challenge that that we would face here. **So, my opinion, or my recommendation is we look at this room, essentially, you can envision what it would take as four small cameras - one in each corner of the room.** So essentially, that would give you two cameras to capture whoever speaking on the board, or on these sides. And then cameras back here who could capture also these sides and also whoever speaking at this podium. And if you're going to do a presentation, whether it's streaming, I'll get the actually to your question in just a moment. On the on the captioning issue and other things.

that it really need, **you need those four cameras minimum.** Very similar setup, we actually put a, an installation very similar to this and Brubeck theater about five years ago, I think. So we've done that once on campus, very similar situation, we would probably need some lighting equipment up here, at some, **at least some small lights to illuminate the board members a little bit better.** Uh, audio - we would have to figure out a way - **right now we cannot take the output of the audio in this room into any other equipment. It wasn't built that way. So, we would have to either replace equipment or get some sort of add on equipment.** So I did a rough estimate on current cost kind of looking at what we did with the Brubeck Theater, what I've been involved with in the past, and what this room specifically would need, **I came up with a cost of around \$42,000,** roughly just any equipment costs to really do it properly. Based on my experience, and also what we experienced with the Brubeck Theatre, I would say round number, **you're probably talking about 50,000 by the time you've got to do wiring and other things that the unknown costs that come in as that comes along.** Another kind of unique challenge

here in this room is there's nowhere in this room to put the switcher the video switcher, the camera controls and other things that would be a part of that. There's there's no room in the back to do that there's nowhere really to have two people sitting to do that. So that would have to be another thing that would have to be figured out is where would we put that equipment? So you have a basically a small, two small boxes that two people have to sit after do all the controlling and do that. Umm...I don't know the answer to that question. **I'm not that familiar with this building, if there's a room somewhere back here that can be repurposed for that, but we'd have to figure that part out.** I looked at I talked to some colleagues at KOCT in Oceanside, they have a crew of four that that does the streaming of the Oceanside council meetings. I think that's about the same as what we're looking at here - a minimum of three probably four people to actually do that. So **So personnel is another cost that would get built in and having people to do that.** And who those people are, you have to have somebody actually controlling the cameras, you have to have somebody actually operating video switcher to decide which camera is going to be on the air at the time. And then somebody following the audio, you certainly.....my experience is you don't want to all the microphones on at once. That can lead to problems, I want the microphone on for the person who's speaking, and nobody else at that moment in time. So and then usually a technical person would be there, we would probably need somebody from this (inaudible). So here probably somebody from IS is hanging around just to make sure that we have bandwidth available to do that, appropriately. There would be some prep involved, as far as graphic preparation. Think about tonight, we've had multiple presentations here on the screen, all of that would have to be pre-packaged so that it can be get put up full-screen on the screen. So that all takes a little bit of time as well. So at least do some prep time for everybody involved. So certainly not bad reasons that it couldn't be done. It could be done it's just there are costs involved, personnel involved that we don't really have on the ground at the moment. And and there are a lot of prep time that would they would have to be some coordination happening with all of that. To your question, I think your question was opposed to live streaming as opposed to recording

Nancy Ann Hensch 11:04

My concern was making sure that the live stream was accessible not only for people who couldn't be here, but for those who are hard of hearing or in some other way we're unable to closed captioning to be a nice a computer program. It's not as efficient Siri doesn't always get me always right.... and I'm talking to her all the time.

Jim Odom 11:23

There. So there, you can push that two ways. There are there are currently some live captioning options online. YouTube has a live captioning option video does. They're not very good. They're 50 60%

Nancy Ann Hensch 11:37

My concern is, especially since we are talking about contracts, there's a lot of (*deal? real?*), information that

Jim Odom 11:41

Yeah, they are not that great.

You can get good live captioning, but is extremely expensive. I can't give you a quote off top of my head. But you're probably for a board meeting, you're talking thousands of dollars. I'm not sure exactly. But it's very expensive, because you have more multiple people involved having to do that and happens if you watch network television, it's it's hit or miss there even and they're paying a lot of money for that. So so that is probably that the captioning part of it would need to be something added on later, which would certainly doesn't address the issue of the live procedure and how that would go.

There's a lot of moving pieces on this. It's it's um I don't know questions I guess I just said you have questions of me. I'm giving you what I my experience has been and

Norma Miyamoto 12:35

Yes, thank you. I understand what you've explained. I'm wondering if the Board, if we might look at other rooms as possibilities. The black box, HBT.... maybe P-32. MD-157, D-10... whether any of those rooms might be suitable for for Board meetings. I mean, back in the day, I know that the Board met in D-10 on a couple of occasions.

Jim Odom 13:03

I do know from other conversations that MD-157 is wired for (inaudible) when it was built - correct me if I'm wrong I think that's right. I think when it was built..... (Other unknown male speaker interjects to say "but it's also scheduled for classes. Yeah"). That's the only room I know of on campus that has parts already there that would help with the process.

Joi Lin Blake 13:28

I know I was having conversations that are researching boardrooms, because thisboardroom needs a renovation.....(Norma Miyamoto adds in "yes"). And so now I've taken pictures at other board rooms when I'm traveling. And so I talked to Dennis and Chris, about doing a remodel on this board room. So that may be something we do in the long term. But that was in our queue to refresh this room. Were we planning on refreshing it in the next six months, a year? Probably not. But when they said, like, "NO" (laughter) but when (*what was?*) became available, because there's other ways that we can use technology like with the computers we have here. Boardrooms have, are more digital and technology friendly and savvy, where there's monitors, my last picture had monitors all over the room. So all the presentation show the agenda was, but that room was designed to telecast, to live stream their Board meetings. But there is definitely a set up in a way the Board is set up is different and the way the audience is set up. So that was in our plan to remodel this room, this particular space, or look at another configuration. But it was more a long time ago because we need to find the resources to do it. **Because that wasn't part of our Prop M projects to remodel this room.**

Norma Miyamoto 15:00

Yeah, I guess I wonder since this request has come to us really from a member of the disabled community here on campus. **I wonder if we're ADA compliant.** I mean, to **what do we need to do to do the right thing, because it is the right thing** or.....

Joi Lin Blake 15:20

Right now, states our board agenda.

We have posted it if you need an accommodation, that we will make the accommodation. And so therefore we have with the particular faculty member that made the request, **we've asked if you need an interpreter, we asked what the accommodation was, and made that.** So if anyone comes to us with an accommodation, we do respond to that. **And we do make that appropriate accommodation.** But that is properly noticed to the community that there are accommodations... (inaudible).

Jim Odom 15:51

Can I make one comment? That all of the things I was looking at. That's that's the primary thing I was considering was having heard the recommendation and reasons that it was made. primary things I was looking at is how you how you do this and make it better than being here or make it at least as accessible as being here. And so that's why I'm saying you know, that we would need that kind of setup that we would because to be able to see individual faces be able to hear everything that everyone's saying does, you know, I think I think there's kind of a perception that because things have become so easy and streaming and, and other things that it's just easy to do. And the fact is that it is easy to do except that you want it done well, it still does require a lot of work, in fact, a lot of like a lot of family.

Joi Lin Blake 16:42

And I want to add, you know, I as a person with a disability and look at how (handles?) are.... the mobility issues. **I'm very sensitive to that.** And I just had a meeting with our facilities, folks and all of our new buildings to ensure that they have integrated the seven universal design principles. So all of our facilities are accessible from the onset. So doesn't matter what the disability is, the building, all of our new facilities are set up to make the appropriate accommodation. So Chris and Dennis know that from the top of my list, because I'm a person with a disability, my master's(inaudible). **So I'm like, I have an eye for any potential barriers for anyone, depending no matter what the disability.**

Nina Deerfield 17:34

Yes. So what about....**I was told that we were going to have the recordings up and accessible....**had to be custom... (male voice "Sit down")

Joi Lin Blake 17:38

(laughter) **okay let me follow up with Deborah because I believe there was an issue with the captioning, that's why she didn't post it. So I'll follow up with her.**

Nina Deerfield 17:53

I know we have to caption it, but from what I understand it's.....

Joi Lin Blake 17:56

they don't have... but she [Debra Doefler?] **was supposed to post it, but we were going to post it with the caption. I think that was the delay.** And so....

(Nina: *is she the right person?*) Debrah's the right person, she's a board secretary, so she's the one woman. (you clear it with.....)(Nina, "Yeah but she doesn't have background... what technical department?") I know, but she would work. She is working with the captioning department to look at the cost. So she's looking at the cost. So let me follow up with her. Because she's a Board Secretary, (in charge of?) looking at the captioning. I know there was a cost issue. So she was trying to resolve that.

Nina Deerfield 18:28

So what I hear from the council member, it's \$6 an hour.

Joi Lin Blake 18:32

Okay, well, I don't know what the council member....what their, what their, what their budget is, and how they have to go about it. But we're governed by a Title 5 and Ed Code. We have to make sure that it follows what we're regulated by. OK, so the State has certain requirements for this.

Nina Deerfield 18:48

Well this has been two months since you told me it'd be put up....

Joi Lin Blake 18:51

Okay, well, I will follow up with her and find out where she is with it okay? (Nina, "can we have it on the next agenda?") I will follow up with her, we can put it on the next agenda, yeah. (Nina, "Okay great") but you know, like...yeah well you...

Jim Odom 19:03

jumping on it. So yeah, just the process of captioning just so everybody knows. So whether it's audio or whether video. So essentially, we worked with mostly here we work with a company called AST, Automatic Sync Technology or several of those that Palomar has a relationship with them, they do a great job, but we send them the product to be captioned and the turnaround can be - **you can pay extra, it can be very quick - or it can take weeks to get it done.** It just depends. **And a lot of it does depend on the audio quality, whether they can use their essentially automated technique to do it, or if they have that humans actually doing that. So there's a lot of moving pieces on that as well. How do you want good, you know, good quality and good accurate captioning.... even at the best, we still probably correct 10% of what we get back from most of our programming and PCTV. Because they miss it. It's uh captioning (inaudible)**

Joi Lin Blake 19:57

Okay.

Mark Evilsizer 20:03

So, based on the conversation and information that I understand during this, I don't think we're prepared financially or, technically, to proceed with live streaming at this point in time. It sounds like something we want to get to. And there's money or facilities (or) improvements that are planned out there. We just don't have it right now. So, I would be against I'm going to personally vote against this at

this time. But understanding that it is it is proposed for further announcement....anybody else want to comment?

Nina Deerfield 20:43

Yeah, I'm going to vote for it because of the enormous district that we have. And we are completely isolated. Everybody that doesn't live right here. At this, we're just bring in the community. Bring in much more shared governance....(and I can't...Palomar if you... and in the long term it would help way more people, so)

Nancy Ann Hensch 21:07

So I would like to comment. I think it's very important that if, if we decide to go with live streaming, we do it well. I don't want to be ...have Palomar represented and have it looked like yeah, amateur night or public access TV from 1982. I mean, I just want it to be good. I want a good product for the college, I want to be proud of what's out there. I want to reach everybody. You know, I work in a disabled population, I think it's of an utmost importance that we reach as many people, but we need to do it effectively and appropriately. So, you know, I think that's something that we should definitely look at long term if we are considering refurbishing the room and giving them a facelift. And we can take a look at getting that all done. And do it right the first time. You know, and then make the appropriate ADA accommodations as necessary as we move forward. And so that's my that's my opinion. Thank you.

Norma Miyamoto 22:14

My comment earlier, the rooms that I cited are, are ...(inaudible)....by moving to another location does that in any way help facilitate something that we would do in the meantime, while we wait for the the refurbishing of the room.

Joi Lin Blake (?) 22:30

I guess what we can do is put this on hold and do the investigation on the rooms and see what the classroom utilization time is. (someone sighs)

Joi Lin Blake 22:41

You know that we need the classroom space (Norma, "I understand that")..... So when we look at instruction (Norma, "right...").... I would need this..., because I go "where are we going to put the classes?" (Shannon Lienhart interjects: "Here") So that's a challenge for us. I think that given the fact that we've already started the conversation about renovating this room....ut gives us an opportunity to do that. And to do it right.

.....would be.....because we're gonna have to spend money even if it's partially,

....then we're still gonna have to pay for the staff. We're still there's going to be costs involved. So if we're going to do it, I think that we work right now to get the recordings captioned and posted and bring that report back to the board on that in (June?).... and we should call in a vote.

Mark Evilsizer 23:30

Let's go ahead and call for the vote. All those in favor of....(inaudible conversation between Board members....)

Norma Miyamoto 23:39

Can you repeat that motion?

Mark Evilsizer 23:41

Well, the motion is to make a decision regarding the livestreaming of governing board meetings. Those in favor of livestreaming governing board meetings at this point vote aye...

So, how does the board vote?

Miyamoto: Aye **Deerfield: Aye**

Evilsizer: I'm against **Halcon: Against** **Hensch: Against at this time.**

Mark Evilsizer 24:02

Okay, so that doesn't carry.