



Fellow Wolverines,

I have spent the last week reflecting deeply on the resolution that has been brought to my desk, A.R. 7-109 “A RESOLUTION FOR THE UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN TO INVESTIGATE DIVESTMENT FROM COMPANIES THAT VIOLATE PALESTINIAN HUMAN RIGHTS.” This is a pivotal moment in the history of the advocacy that underlies this resolution, as it passed the Central Student Government (CSG) Assembly for the very first time. As I have deliberated over whether to sign the resolution or veto it, I have considered the two elements of this resolution that appear to be in conflict one another: the intended spirit of this resolution, and the actual impact that it has.

I believe the intent of this resolution is to elevate a marginalized community’s voice, voices that have been muffled and diluted, year after year. I believe the students who advocate for the investigation of companies in which the University of Michigan is invested that are tied to the violation of Palestinian human rights do so because they believe in advocating for what is just. I believe the authors and advocates of this resolution do not intend to target Jewish people, and I do not believe that criticism of Israel is inherently anti-Semitic. I believe the University of Michigan should not invest in companies that endanger the lives of Palestinian people.

Understanding that the spirit of the resolution is such, I must note the actual impact of this resolution, and the lack of explicit clarity surrounding its intent. Three issues should be considered by proponents of A.R. 7-019, about which I must caution the campus community that advocates for this resolution in coming years.

First, throughout the process of debating this resolution, authors and proponents of A.R. 7-019 stated that their advocacy for divestment from the specified companies is completely distinct from the Boycott, Divest, and Sanction (BDS) Movement — **I do not believe this.** The BDS Movement has a troubling history of anti-Semitism, upon which both opponents and advocates of A.R. 7-019 agree. The student organization that proposed A.R. 7-019, Students Allied for Freedom & Equality (SAFE), designates in its constitution (view here: <http://www.safeumich.com/about.html>) a “BDS Chair,” whose listed responsibilities “include leading and facilitating any of the BDS initiatives that SAFE will engage in and ensuring attempts towards progress with respect to BDS are being made.” The first version of A.R. 7-019 that was proposed to the Assembly included citations from the BDS Movement, which were finally replaced when Jewish students pointed out the discrepancy between the intent of the authors to separate this resolution from the BDS movement versus its continued and clear ties to the movement. At this point, it is unclear how directly tied A.R. 7-019 is to the BDS Movement. I strongly encourage that proponents of A.R. 7-019 explicitly distance and distinguish the divestment resolution from the BDS Movement immediately.

Second, University of Michigan Professor Victor Lieberman was blocked from speaking at the CSG Assembly meeting on Tuesday. Some Assembly representatives claimed that allowing Victor Lieberman to speak would have created a power gradient between professors and students because the many professors that do support A.R. 7-019 do not have the same privilege to speak, for fear of losing their jobs or being placed on probation. **This is not true.** Twenty University of Michigan faculty members signed SAFE’s Statement of Solidarity to Support Divestment 2017, several of whom are tenured faculty; any of these Michigan faculty members could have spoken in favor of A.R. 7-019. Furthermore, the guest speakers from the author’s side were not current students, so it did not remain a student-to-student issue, as was the stated intention of the author of the resolution when issuing the objection to Victor Lieberman speaking during the meeting. **Voting to prevent Victor Lieberman from speaking fostered uncontextualized dialogue around this issue, especially as another speaker with parallel credentials could have spoken, too.** As such, CSG will conduct a review of its guest speaker practices and regulations in advance of the next Assembly meeting.

Third, many Jewish students have voiced that this resolution is anti-Semitic. Even if the intent of A.R. 7-019 is not to target Jewish students for tying their faith to Israel, we must listen to why it is that so many Jewish students still feel the impact of modern-day anti-Semitic sentiments in the resolution. As a community, we need to discuss why it is that we feel this resolution’s critique only of Israel — and no other countries in the region that may be tied to the very same human rights violations against Palestinians — is necessary for it to accomplish its intended purpose. We need to discuss why

some people found it appropriate to hold up signs that say “Stop Silencing Me” when a student shared a personal story of how their grandparents survived the Holocaust. **Just because someone disagrees with you or shares a different narrative does not mean that they are silencing you** and exaggeration of this will not help the ultimate cause of the resolution. Unless we listen, with the desire to understand other narratives, the impact of this resolution will continue to be the silencing of one voice in an effort to elevate another. That will be the demise of this resolution’s cause if proponents and opponents alike of this resolution do not address this dynamic.

These issues must not be ignored. If the students who advocate for the elevation of Palestinian voices seek to build campus community support for the ultimate cause of A.R. 7-019, then these issues and others must be taken into account. Unless these issues are seriously considered by advocates of this resolution, it will be very difficult to garner the broad and consistent campus community support necessary for the university to even form an investigative committee to this end. With the bar for divestment as high as it is and the bar for broad and consistently demonstrated community support as high as it is, the success of this advocacy will come down to finding ways to ensure that the resolution and the advocacy that surrounds it do not vilify Jewish students for tying their faith to the one Jewish State, and instead seek to emphasize the ultimate cause of the resolution — to create a committee to investigate any investments that the University of Michigan has that may be tied to the violation of Palestinian human rights.

Ultimately, **the spirit of this resolution is to elevate the voices of students** who believe in protecting Palestinian human rights. The spirit of the resolution embodies the University of Michigan’s mission statement — to **challenge the present** — and the University’s vision statement, which specifically says that we must **dedicate ourselves to responsible stewardship of financial resources**. At its very core, calling for an investigative committee to review University investments that may be tied to the violation of Palestinian human rights is an embodiment of the University’s mission and values. It is for these reasons that **with discretion, I have signed this resolution**. The voices in favor of this resolution should be recognized as elevating legitimate outcry against ongoing human rights violations against Palestinian people in which the University of Michigan may be invested, and if I were to veto this resolution because of my concerns about its procedural shortcomings, those voices would not receive this much-needed elevation. My elevation of this resolution’s ultimate cause to the Board of Regents will be to **call for the creation of a committee to investigate University of Michigan investments that may be tied to the violation of Palestinian human rights, without specification of which companies or countries should be targeted; this ensures that the scope of investigation is not unnecessarily limited to the companies specified in A.R. 7-019, as there may be other investments tied to the ultimate cause. It also ensures that no one state or faith tied to it is unduly targeted.**

This is the first time in University of Michigan history that this resolution has passed the CSG Assembly, which means that the work to actualize it is only beginning — both for the students who support this resolution, and for those who oppose it. In order to build the community support necessary for the Board of Regents to form this committee, communities on all sides of this resolution will need to present a strong and united front that jointly advocates for divestment from companies that violate the human rights of Palestinian people. The University of Michigan should not invest in companies that may be tied to the oppression of the Palestinian people, and I find the request for the creation of an investigative committee to be reasonable. It is time for this issue to be elevated to the Board of Regents, regardless of the decision that it chooses to make on this question; in coming years, I am hopeful that the advocacy around this issue will continue to grow inclusively under the framework of community-building and finding common ground.

With discretion and caution regarding the aforementioned, I hereby sign A.R. 7-019.

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Anushka Sarkar". The signature is fluid and cursive, with a large, stylized 'S' at the end.

Anushka Sarkar
Student Body President



ASSEMBLY RESOLUTION 7-019

**RESOLUTION FOR THE UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN TO INVESTIGATE
DIVESTMENT FROM COMPANIES THAT VIOLATE PALESTINIAN HUMAN
RIGHTS**

WHEREAS, all students have the responsibility, as tuition-paying members of the University of Michigan community, to critically review and examine the ethics of the University’s financial investments; **AND**

WHEREAS, the President’s Advisory Committee on Labor Standards and Human Rights serves to “promote University leadership in corporate citizenship with respect to fair labor practices, human rights, and sustainability in its licensing operations”¹; **AND**

WHEREAS, the Procurement Services of the Business and Finance Office at The University of Michigan are committed to “socially responsible procurement [which] is defined as conducting the University of Michigan's business in a manner that meets or exceeds the ethical, legal, commercial and public expectations that society has of business operation”²; **AND**

WHEREAS, in 2016 the Board of Regents, with the support of Central Student Government (CSG), voted to reinstate bylaw 7.01 that expresses the importance of student participation in University decision making, and that, “The Vice President for Student Life will assist students in promoting the establishment of effective mechanisms for such student participation. The University is best served when it considers the impacts of decisions on the student body”³; **AND**

¹ University of Michigan President’s Advisory Committee on Labor Standards and Human Rights: [Charge to the Standing Committee](#)

² University of Michigan Finance: [Socially Responsible Procurement](#)

³ [CSG resolution to reinstate bylaw 7.01](#); The Michigan Daily: [“Board of Regents votes to reinstate student input into their bylaws”](#)

WHEREAS, students' right to examine the social and moral implications of our investments was further reaffirmed by CSG in 2015 when it approved a resolution to investigate investments in the fossil fuel industry⁴; **AND**

WHEREAS, the University of Michigan's Board of Regents' divestment from South African Apartheid in 1978 and from tobacco-related companies in 2000 set a moral and procedural precedent for ethical divestment from socially irresponsible companies⁵; **AND**

WHEREAS, Students Allied for Freedom and Equality (SAFE) is a student organization dedicated to advancing the causes of freedom, justice, human rights and equality for Palestinians and all peoples; **AND**

WHEREAS, as the example of the anti-Apartheid divestment movement shows, it is imperative for students to stand unequivocally against all forms of racism and bigotry globally and on campus, including anti-Semitism, Islamophobia, anti-Black racism, xenophobia, homophobia, and the anti-Palestinian discrimination reinforced by human rights violations; **AND**

WHEREAS, the authors of the resolution are committed to promoting dignity and respect for all people, and emphasize that the request contained herein is not intended to be an attack on any particular identity—especially Jewish identity—or a sweeping criticism of the state of Israel but rather is meant as an acknowledgement of marginalized students' concerns on campus regarding the University's investments in unethical corporate practice abroad; **AND**

WHEREAS, SAFE represents the view of Palestinian students and their allies on campus that Palestinian human rights are violated by the Israeli military's use of weapons and equipment from several companies in which the University invests; **AND**

WHEREAS, Palestinian students and their allies often risk their safety and

⁴ The Michigan Daily: "[CSG Proposes Committee for Fossil Fuel Divestment](#)"

⁵ University of Michigan Investment Policy [South Africa and Tobacco Divestment](#)

frequently face intimidation for raising the concern herein presented, including threats of being added to a blacklist that often appears on background checks, which unfairly demonizes, slanders, and compromises their post-graduation and career prospects; **AND**

WHEREAS, in its Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion (DEI) plan, the University continually expresses its commitment to efforts of equity and inclusion that provide underrepresented students an environment “where every individual feels a sense of belonging and inclusion”⁶; **AND**

WHEREAS, Palestinian students, as a minority group on campus, receive not the University’s full support, nor the benefits of its plan to foster a more inclusive climate, so long as a proportion of the endowment is invested by the University in companies that violate Palestinian human rights in Israel; **AND**

WHEREAS, United Nations Resolution 242 recognizes Israel’s occupation of Palestinian lands, specifically the territories of the West Bank, the Gaza Strip, and East Jerusalem⁷; **AND**

WHEREAS, United Nations Resolutions 446, 452, 465, 471 and 476 recognize that the expansion of Israeli settlements – which serve as locations of operation for military technology companies that the University of Michigan invests in – are illegal under international law as described in the provisions of the Fourth Geneva Convention; **AND**

WHEREAS, Israeli state policy infringes upon Palestinian human rights in such ways as the building of settlements on occupied Palestinian land⁸, the uneven distribution of land and water resources⁹, the unlawful

⁶ “Executive Summary” in *Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion Strategic Plan*.

⁷ Includes Areas A, B, and C in the West Bank. The UN cites all the territory occupied in 1967 under resolution 242 which predates the Oslo Accords.

⁸ [Israeli Settlement Policy](#)

⁹ [World Bank Report of Water Restrictions Palestinians Denied Fair Access to Water](#); [Water and Sanitation in Palestine](#)

demolition of Palestinian homes¹⁰, the administrative detention of Palestinians without charge¹¹, the system of checkpoints preventing Palestinians' right to freedom of movement¹², the siege and blockade of the occupied Gaza Strip¹³, the unlawful execution of Palestinians¹⁴, and the killing of Palestinians in military assaults on the occupied Gaza Strip through all-out war¹⁵; **AND**

WHEREAS, the June 30, 2016 University of Michigan Directly Held Public Equities report lists investments in Boeing, Hewlett-Packard, and United Technologies, three companies that supply weapons and equipment to Israel's illegal occupation of Palestinian territories in violation of international human rights law¹⁶; **AND**

WHEREAS, in 2016 the University of Michigan's investments were valued at approximately \$14.8 million for the three companies in total; in Boeing at approximately \$7.7 million, in Hewlett-Packard at approximately \$3.9 million, and in United Technologies at approximately \$3.2 million; **AND**

WHEREAS, Boeing "has been a major supplier of the F-15 Eagle and the AH-64 Apache attack helicopters to Israel. These aircrafts have been used to attack Palestinians in the Occupied Territories, resulting in many civilian casualties. Boeing makes missile systems, F-15 software, Apache Helicopters, and Joint Direct Attack Munitions (JDAM), a guided air-to-surface weapon"¹⁷; **AND**

WHEREAS, Hewlett-Packard provides "biometric identification systems used at Israeli military checkpoints, which restrict the freedom of movement of Palestinians, facilitate discrimination against Palestinians, and reinforce a stratification of citizenship,"¹⁸ and

¹⁰ [Unlawful West Bank Home Demolitions](#); [Israeli Committee Against Home Demolitions](#)

¹¹ [Administrative Detention of Palestinians](#)

¹² [Palestinians' Freedom of Movement](#); [Checkpoint Statistics](#)

¹³ [Siege and Blockade of Gaza](#); [Ten Years of Israeli Siege of Gaza](#); [Gaza Becoming Uninhabitable](#); [UNOCHA Blockade of Gaza](#)

¹⁴ [Unlawful Killings of Palestinians](#)

¹⁵ [UN Report on 2008-2009 Israeli War on Gaza](#); [UN Report on 2014 Israeli War on Gaza](#)

¹⁶ [University of Michigan Directly Held Public Equities](#)

¹⁷ [Companies Supporting Israeli Occupation: Boeing](#); [Boeing Products Provided to Israel](#)

¹⁸ [Northwestern University Divestment Resolution](#)

provides technological services to the Israeli Prison Authority, and provides services and technologies to the Israeli army, among which is the administration of the Israeli navy's IT infrastructure, and the Israeli navy has enforced the naval blockade on the Gaza Strip since 2007; **AND**

WHEREAS, United Technologies provides “Blackhawk helicopters which are used by the Israeli military to attack Palestinian cities, refugee camps and villages. Many civilians have been killed in these attacks [...] [the] Pratt and Whitney Division produces engines for Israel’s F-15 and F-16 aircraft, which have been used against Palestinian civilians”¹⁹; **AND**

WHEREAS, the University’s Chief Investment Officer in 2005 laid out the process for forming a committee to investigate the University’s investments that requires the following three principles to be met: “The concern to be explored must express the broadly and consistently held position of the campus community over time; there must be reason to believe that the behavior or action in question may be antithetical to the core mission and values of the University; and there must be reason to believe that the organization, industry or entity to be singled out may be uniquely responsible for the problems identified”²⁰; **AND**

WHEREAS, the concern presented here meets the first principle insofar as it has been expressed broadly and consistently by the campus community over time, as evidenced by the accompanying statement of support,²¹ signed by student organizations that represent thousands of students on campus, as well as faculty and other campus community members; **AND**

WHEREAS, the concern presented here meets the second principle insofar as the corporate behavior in question is antithetical to the values of the University, because of its aforementioned commitment to diversity, equity, and inclusion, and further based on the express purpose of the University’s endowment, which is not to “be

¹⁹ [Companies Supporting Israeli Occupation: United Technologies](#)

²⁰ [University Investment Policy](#)

²¹ [Op-ed in the Michigan Daily](#) lists student organization support

regarded [as] an instrument of political or social power [but rather to] provide income for the advancement of the important educational and cultural objectives to which the University is dedicated”²²; **AND**

WHEREAS, the concern presented here meets the third principle of responsibility insofar as the Israeli military’s use of the weapons and technology supplied by Boeing, HP, and United Technologies violates Palestinian human rights, and these three companies are therefore uniquely responsible for the deprivation of certain universal human rights, such as the rights “to life, liberty, and security of person;” “to education;” to “privacy, family [and] home;” for Palestinians affected by the checkpoints, prisons, etc. that are serviced by these companies²³; **AND**

WHEREAS, the University of Michigan’s investments in the aforementioned companies —whose operations in occupied Palestinian territories are socially and ethically irresponsible — not only personally impact Palestinian students at the University of Michigan, but also call into question the University’s long-standing commitment to invest in socially responsible companies; **AND**

WHEREAS, Palestinian civil society has called on people of conscience around the world to financially pressure companies that contract with the Israeli military until such time it complies with international law²⁴; **AND**

WHEREAS, more than thirty universities across the US such as Stanford University, University of California at Berkeley, Northwestern University, and University of Chicago have passed resolutions to divest from companies that profit from the abuse of Palestinian human rights in Israel and its illegal settlements and that help to facilitate the illegal Israeli occupation of the Palestinian territories²⁵; **AND**

²² [1978 Report and Recommendations](#) of the Senate Assembly Advisory Committee on Financial Affairs on Investment Policies and Social Responsibility

²³ [UCLA Divestment Resolution](#)

²⁴ [Palestinian Civil Society Call](#)

²⁵ [Appendix 2](#) “Universities Passing Divestment”

WHEREAS, following divestment from Apartheid South Africa, it was decided that, “If the Regents shall determine that a particular issue involves extremely serious moral or ethical questions which are of considerable concern to many members of the University community, an advisory committee consisting of members of the University Senate, students, administration and alumni will be appointed to gather information and formulate recommendations for the Regents’ consideration”²⁶; **AND**

WHEREAS, the process of forming an ad hoc committee is assumed by University precedent,²⁷ which following the cases of Apartheid South Africa and tobacco companies, granted the Board of Regents the responsibility to appoint ad hoc committees to investigate divestment²⁸; **AND**

WHEREAS, committee formation by the Regents may follow the report of the Senate Assembly Advisory Committee on Investment Policies and Social Responsibilities, which recommended that the committee membership be “broadly representative of the University community,” and therefore may include “two members of the University Senate appointed by the Senate Advisory Committee on University Affairs, two students appointed by the current official student government organization, and two administrators appointed by the President.”²⁹; **AND**

WHEREAS, committee proceedings may take action in the following sequence, as determined by the Senate Assembly Advisory Committee: “(1) direct communication of the University’s concern to corporate management via letters or meetings; (2) the publication of statements describing the University’s [position on the company’s unethical behavior] and where appropriate, explanation of these statements at shareholders meetings; (3) divestiture of University holdings in the corporation.”³⁰; **AND**

²⁶ [University of Michigan Board of Regents "March Meeting, 1978"](#)

²⁷ [University Investment Policy](#)

²⁸ [University Investment Policy](#)

²⁹ [1978 Report and Recommendations](#)

³⁰ Ibid.

WHEREAS, the authors recognize the potential for the financial effects of divestment to implicate the University's relationship with these three companies, and therefore ask for the committee's foremost responsibility to be the investigation of these effects through a minimum year-long process of communication with each of the companies, a precedent set by the University's process for divestment from Apartheid South Africa³¹; **THEREFORE BE IT**

RESOLVED, that CSG calls upon the University of Michigan Regents to follow University precedent and appoint a committee, as stipulated above, to investigate the ethical and moral implications of our investments in the corporations Boeing, HP, and United Technologies, which are involved in humans rights violations against the Palestinian people according to international law³²; **AND BE IT FURTHER**

RESOLVED, that CSG requests the University of Michigan asset managers to divest, if deemed appropriate by the ad hoc committee's recommendations following an investigation by that committee, as soon as such divestment may be accomplished from all such companies that, within one year from the date of engagement, remain uncommitted to a diligent plan to terminate all such unethical business activities; **AND BE IT FURTHER**

RESOLVED, that CSG requests the University of Michigan asset managers investigate possible alternatives for investment such that the University's assets and investment strategies are not harmed; **AND BE IT FURTHER**

RESOLVED, that upon passage of this resolution the request herein presented shall embody the University of Michigan's deeply held principles of justice and equality for all people, and affirms that the Palestinian people are not exempt from these principles; **AND BE IT FINALLY**

³¹ [University of Michigan Board of Regents "March Meeting, 1978"](#)

³² Relevant violations of international law: U.N. Charter, Article 25 (1945); U.N. Security Council Resolutions 54, 111, 194, 233, 234, 236, 248, 250, 252, 256, 262, 267, 270, 280, 285, 298, 313, 316, 468, 476.

RESOLVED, that a copy of this resolution be sent to the University of Michigan Board of Regents, in addition to the President's Advisory Committee on Labor Standards and Human Rights, for their consideration and approval.

Authors

SAFE (Students Allied for Freedom and Equality) Hafsa Tout, LSA

Yara Gayar, LSA

Sponsors

Jamie Thompson, LSA

Attest

Alex Contis, LSA
Speaker of the Assembly

Ali Rosenblatt, Engineering
Vice Speaker of the Assembly

President's Approval

Anushka Sarkar

Presented to the Assembly for *First Reads* on _____

Presented to the Assembly for *Second Reads* on _____

Yes: _____ No: _____ Abs: _____ Date: _____

Signature Necessary: _____ Signature Received By _____: _____



REDLINED ASSEMBLY RESOLUTION 7-019

**RESOLUTION FOR THE UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN TO INVESTIGATE
DIVESTMENT FROM COMPANIES THAT VIOLATE PALESTINIAN HUMAN
RIGHTS**

- WHEREAS,** all students have the responsibility, as tuition-paying members of the University of Michigan community, to critically review and examine the ethics of the University's financial investments; **AND**
- WHEREAS,** the President's Advisory Committee on Labor Standards and Human Rights serves to "promote University leadership in corporate citizenship with respect to fair labor practices, human rights, and sustainability in its licensing operations"¹; **AND**
- WHEREAS,** the Procurement Services of the Business and Finance Office at The University of Michigan are committed to "socially responsible procurement [which] is defined as conducting the University of Michigan's business in a manner that meets or exceeds the ethical, legal, commercial and public expectations that society has of business operation"²; **AND**
- WHEREAS,** in 2016 the Board of Regents, with the support of Central Student Government (CSG), voted to reinstate bylaw 7.01 that expresses the importance of student participation in University decision making, and that, "The Vice President for Student Life will assist students in promoting the establishment of effective mechanisms for such student participation. The University is best served when it considers the impacts of decisions on the student body"³; **AND**
- WHEREAS,** students' right to examine the social and moral implications of our investments was further reaffirmed by CSG in 2015 when it approved a

¹ University of Michigan President's Advisory Committee on Labor Standards and Human Rights: [Charge to the Standing Committee](#)

² University of Michigan Finance: [Socially Responsible Procurement](#)

³ [CSG resolution to reinstate bylaw 7.01](#); The Michigan Daily: "[Board of Regents votes to reinstate student input into their bylaws](#)"

resolution to investigate investments in the fossil fuel industry⁴; **AND**

WHEREAS, the University of Michigan’s Board of Regents’ divestment from South African Apartheid in 1978 and from tobacco-related companies in 2000 set a moral and procedural precedent for ethical divestment from socially irresponsible companies⁵; **AND**

WHEREAS, Students Allied for Freedom and Equality (SAFE) is a student organization dedicated to advancing the causes of freedom, justice, human rights and equality for Palestinians and all peoples; **AND**

WHEREAS, as the example of the anti-Apartheid divestment movement shows, it is imperative for students to stand unequivocally against all forms of racism and bigotry globally and on campus, including anti-Semitism, Islamophobia, anti-Black racism, xenophobia, homophobia, and the anti-Palestinian discrimination reinforced by human rights violations; **AND**

WHEREAS, the authors of the resolution are committed to promoting dignity and respect for all people, and emphasize that the request contained herein is not an attack on any particular identity—~~especially Jewish identity—or a sweeping criticism of the state of Israel~~ but rather is meant as an acknowledgement of marginalized students’ concerns on campus regarding the University’s investments in unethical corporate practices abroad; **AND**

WHEREAS, SAFE represents the view of Palestinian students and their allies on campus that Palestinian human rights are violated by the ~~Israeli military’s~~ use of weapons and equipment from several companies in which the University invests; **AND**

WHEREAS, Palestinian students and their allies often risk their safety and frequently face intimidation for raising the concern herein presented, including threats of being added to a blacklist that often appears on background checks, which unfairly demonizes, slanders, and compromises their post-graduation and career prospects; **AND**

WHEREAS, in its Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion (DEI) plan, the University

⁴The Michigan Daily: “[CSG Proposes Committee for Fossil Fuel Divestment](#)”

⁵ University of Michigan Investment Policy [South Africa and Tobacco Divestment](#)

continually expresses its commitment to efforts of equity and inclusion that provide underrepresented students an environment “where every individual feels a sense of belonging and inclusion;”⁶AND

WHEREAS, Palestinian students, as a minority group on campus, receive not the University’s full support, nor the benefits of its plan to foster a more inclusive climate, so long as a proportion of the endowment is invested by the University in companies that violate Palestinian human rights **in Israel**; AND

~~**WHEREAS,** United Nations Resolution 242 recognizes Israel’s occupation of Palestinian lands, specifically the territories of the West Bank, the Gaza Strip, and East Jerusalem⁷; AND~~

~~**WHEREAS,** United Nations Resolutions 446, 452, 465, 471 and 476 recognize that the expansion of Israeli settlements—which serve as locations of operation for military technology companies that the University of Michigan invests in—are illegal under international law as described in the provisions of the Fourth Geneva Convention; AND~~

~~**WHEREAS,** Israeli state policy infringes upon Palestinian human rights in such ways as the building of settlements on occupied Palestinian land⁸, the uneven distribution of land and water resources⁹, the unlawful demolition of Palestinian homes¹⁰, the administrative detention of Palestinians without charge¹¹, the system of checkpoints preventing Palestinians’ right to freedom of movement¹², the siege and blockade of the occupied Gaza Strip¹³, the unlawful execution of Palestinians¹⁴, and the killing of Palestinians in military assaults on the occupied Gaza Strip through all-out~~

⁶“Executive Summary” in *Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion Strategic Plan*.

⁷ Includes Areas A, B, and C in the West Bank. The UN cites all the territory occupied in 1967 under resolution 242 which predates the Oslo Accords.

⁸[Israeli Settlement Policy](#)

⁹[World Bank Report of Water RestrictionsPalestinians Denied Fair Access to Water](#); [Water and Sanitation in Palestine](#)

¹⁰[Unlawful West Bank Home Demolitions](#); [Israeli Committee Against Home Demolitions](#)

¹¹[Administrative Detention of Palestinians](#)

¹²[Palestinians' Freedom of Movement](#); [Checkpoint Statistics](#)

¹³[Siege and Blockade of Gaza](#); [Ten Years of Israeli Siege of Gaza](#); [Gaza Becoming Uninhabitable](#); [UNOCHA Blockade of Gaza](#)

¹⁴[Unlawful Killings of Palestinians](#)

~~war¹⁵; AND~~

~~WHEREAS, the June 30, 2016 University of Michigan Directly Held Public Equities report lists investments in Boeing, Hewlett-Packard, and United Technologies, three companies that supply weapons and equipment to Israel's illegal occupation of Palestinian territories in violation of international human rights law¹⁶; AND~~

~~WHEREAS, in 2016 the University of Michigan's investments were valued approximately \$14.8 million for the three companies in total; in Boeing at approximately \$7.7 million, in Hewlett-Packard at approximately \$3.9 million, and in United Technologies at approximately \$3.2 million; AND~~

~~WHEREAS, Boeing "has been a major supplier of the F-15 Eagle and the AH-64 Apache attack helicopters to Israel. These aircrafts have been used to attack Palestinians in the Occupied Territories, resulting in many civilian casualties. Boeing makes missile systems, F-15 software, Apache Helicopters, and Joint Direct Attack Munitions (JDAM), a guided air-to-surface weapon"¹⁷; AND~~

~~WHEREAS, Hewlett-Packard provides "biometric identification systems used at Israeli military checkpoints, which restrict the freedom of movement of Palestinians, facilitate discrimination against Palestinians, and reinforce a stratification of citizenship,"¹⁸ and provides technological services to the Israeli Prison Authority, and provides services and technologies to the Israeli army, among which is the administration of the Israeli navy's IT infrastructure, and the Israeli navy has enforced the naval blockade on the Gaza Strip since 2007; AND~~

~~WHEREAS, United Technologies provides "Blackhawk helicopters which are used by the Israeli military to attack Palestinian cities, refugee camps and villages. Many civilians have been killed in these attacks [...] [the] Pratt and Whitney Division produces engines for Israel's F-15 and F-16 aircraft, which have been used against Palestinian civilians"¹⁹; AND~~

¹⁵[UN Report on 2008-2009 Israeli War on Gaza](#); [UN Report on 2014 Israeli War on Gaza](#)

¹⁶[University of Michigan Directly Held Public Equities](#)

¹⁷[Companies Supporting Israeli Occupation; Boeing](#); [Boeing Products Provided to Israel](#)

¹⁸[Northwestern University Divestment Resolution](#)

¹⁹[Companies Supporting Israeli Occupation; United Technologies](#)

WHEREAS, the University’s Chief Investment Officer in 2005 laid out the process for forming a committee to investigate the University’s investments that requires the following three principles to be met: “The concern to be explored must express the broadly and consistently held position of the campus community over time; there must be reason to believe that the behavior or action in question may be antithetical to the core mission and values of the University; and there must be reason to believe that the organization, industry or entity to be singled out may be uniquely responsible for the problems identified”²⁰; **AND**

WHEREAS, the concern presented here meets the first principle insofar as it has been expressed broadly and consistently by the campus community over time, as evidenced by the accompanying statement of support,²¹ signed by student organizations that represent thousands of students on campus, as well as faculty and other campus community members; **AND**

WHEREAS, the concern presented here meets the second principle insofar as the corporate behavior in question is antithetical to the values of the University, because of its aforementioned commitment to diversity, equity, and inclusion, and further based on the express purpose of the University’s endowment, which is not to “be regarded [as] an instrument of political or social power [but rather to] provide income for the advancement of the important educational and cultural objectives to which the University is dedicated”²²; **AND**

WHEREAS, the concern presented here meets the third principle of responsibility insofar as the ~~Israeli military’s~~ use of the weapons and technology ~~supplied by Boeing, HP, and United Technologies~~ violates Palestinian human rights, ~~and these three companies are therefore uniquely responsible for the deprivation of certain universal human rights, such as the rights “to life, liberty, and security of person;” “to education;” to “privacy, family [and] home;” for Palestinians~~ affected by the checkpoints, prisons, etc. that are serviced by ~~these~~ companies ~~in which the University of Michigan is invested~~²³; **AND**

²⁰[University Investment Policy](#)

²¹[Op-ed in the Michigan Daily](#) lists student organization support

²²[1978 Report and Recommendations](#) of the Senate Assembly Advisory Committee on Financial Affairs on Investment Policies and Social Responsibility

²³[UCLA Divestment Resolution](#)

WHEREAS, the University of Michigan’s investments in ~~the aforementioned~~ companies —whose operations in occupied Palestinian territories are socially and ethically irresponsible — not only personally impact Palestinian students at the University of Michigan, but also call into question the University’s long-standing commitment to invest in socially responsible companies; **AND**

~~**WHEREAS,** Palestinian civil society has called on people of conscience around the world to financially pressure companies that contract with the Israeli military until such time it complies with international law; AND~~

WHEREAS, more than thirty universities across the US such as Stanford University, University of California at Berkeley, Northwestern University, and University of Chicago have passed resolutions to divest from companies that profit from the abuse of Palestinian human rights ~~in Israel and its illegal settlements and that help to facilitate the illegal Israeli occupation of the Palestinian territories~~²⁴; **AND**

WHEREAS, following divestment from Apartheid South Africa, it was decided that, “If the Regents shall determine that a particular issue involves extremely serious moral or ethical questions which are of considerable concern to many members of the University community, an advisory committee consisting of members of the University Senate, students, administration and alumni will be appointed to gather information and formulate recommendations for the Regents’ consideration”²⁵; **AND**

WHEREAS, the process of forming an ad hoc committee is assumed by University precedent,²⁶ which following the cases of Apartheid South Africa and tobacco companies, granted the Board of Regents the responsibility to appoint ad hoc committees to investigate divestment²⁷; **AND**

WHEREAS, committee formation by the Regents may follow the report of the Senate Assembly Advisory Committee on Investment Policies and Social Responsibilities, which recommended that the committee membership be “broadly representative of the University community,” and therefore may include “two members of the University Senate appointed by the Senate

²⁴[Appendix 2](#) “Universities Passing Divestment”

²⁵[University of Michigan Board of Regents "March Meeting, 1978"](#)

²⁶[University Investment Policy](#)

²⁷[University Investment Policy](#)

Advisory Committee on University Affairs, two students appointed by the current official student government organization, and two administrators appointed by the President.”²⁸; **AND**

WHEREAS, committee proceedings may take action in the following sequence, as determined by the Senate Assembly Advisory Committee: “(1) direct communication of the University’s concern to corporate management via letters or meetings; (2) the publication of statements describing the University’s [position on the company’s unethical behavior] and where appropriate, explanation of these statements at shareholders meetings; (3) divestiture of University holdings in the corporation.”²⁹; **AND**

WHEREAS, the authors recognize the potential for the financial effects of divestment to implicate the University’s relationship with these three companies, and therefore ask for the committee’s foremost responsibility to be the investigation of these effects through a minimum year-long process of communication with each of the companies, a precedent set by the University’s process for divestment from Apartheid South Africa³⁰; **THEREFORE BE IT**

RESOLVED, that CSG calls upon the University of Michigan Regents to follow University precedent and appoint a committee, as stipulated above, to investigate the ethical and moral implications of our investments **in the corporations Boeing, HP, and United Technologies,** which are involved in humans rights violations against the Palestinian people according to international law³¹; **AND BE IT FURTHER**

RESOLVED, that CSG requests the University of Michigan asset managers to divest, if deemed appropriate by the ad hoc committee’s recommendations following an investigation by that committee, as soon as such divestment may be accomplished from all such companies that, within one year from the date of engagement, remain uncommitted to a diligent plan to terminate all such unethical business activities; **AND BE IT FURTHER**

RESOLVED, that CSG requests the University of Michigan asset managers investigate

²⁸ [1978 Report and Recommendations](#)

²⁹ Ibid.

³⁰ [University of Michigan Board of Regents "March Meeting, 1978"](#)

³¹ Relevant violations of international law: U.N. Charter, Article 25 (1945); U.N. Security Council Resolutions 54, 111, 194, 233, 234, 236, 248, 250, 252, 256, 262, 267, 270, 280, 285, 298, 313, 316, 468, 476.

possible alternatives for investment such that the University's assets and investment strategies are not harmed; **AND BE IT FURTHER**

RESOLVED, that upon passage of this resolution the request herein presented shall embody the University of Michigan's deeply held principles of justice and equality for all people, and affirms that the Palestinian people are not exempt from these principles; **AND BE IT FINALLY**

RESOLVED, that a copy of this resolution be sent to the University of Michigan Board of Regents, in addition to the President's Advisory Committee on Labor Standards and Human Rights, for their consideration and approval.

Authors

Students Allied for Freedom and Equality (SAFE)

Hafsa Tout, LSA

Yara Gayar, LSA

Sponsors

Jamie Thompson, LSA

Attest

Alex Contis, LSA
Speaker of the Assembly

Ali Rosenblatt, Engineering
Vice Speaker of the Assembly

President's Approval

Anushka Sarkar

Presented to the Assembly for *First Reads* on _____

Presented to the Assembly for *Second Reads* on _____

Yes: _____ No: _____ Abs: _____ Date: _____

Signature Necessary: _____ Signature Received By _____: _____